Translation Analysis of Subtitle from English into Indonesian in Maleficent Movie

Yuli Kuswardani[1], Erike Septiani[2]
English Department of Universitas PGRI Madiun

Article Info	ABSTRACT
	This research aims at analysing subtitle in Maleficent movie. The research purposes are to analyze the clarity, accuracy and naturalness. Research approach is qualitative research. Research type is library research. Data are required from script of Maleficent movie, reader and experts' evaluation. This research uses documentation as data collecting technique. Researchers use investigator triangulation to make research can be trusted. Result of research shows: (1) clarity of subtitle is high with presentation of clear sentences is 77%, less clear sentence is 19.8% and unclear sentence is 3.2%; (2¬) accuracy of subtitle is high with presentation of accurate translation is 82.5%, less accurate is 14.5% and inaccurate translation is 3%; (3) naturalness of subtitle is high, with presentation of natural translation is 79.2% (1st expert) and 77.1% (2nd expert), less natural translation is 18.3 (1st expert) and 2.4 (2nd expert), and unnatural translaton is 22.3% (1st expert) and 1.6% (2nd expert).

Corresponding Author:
Yuli Kuswardani,
English Department,
Universitas PGRI Madiun,
Jalan Setiabudi No. 85 Madiun, East Java, Indonesia.
Email: zuliekus@gmail.com

1 Introduction

Translation used in a movie through subtitle. Subtitle is a text used in a movie when a movie is played in another language. Based on Karamitroglou (in Chang 2012: 73) "Subtitling can be defined as the translation of the spoken (or written) source text of a film product into a written target text which is added onto the images of the original product, usually at the bottom of the screen." A study by Suherman & Gumawan (2018) has analyzed Indonesian subtitled of the film. The result shows that that the process of translating involves single and double translation shifts. Then, Sarasmara & Yuliasri (2018) also conduct the study about translation techniques in Indonesia subtitled movie. The result found seven translation techniques used in theIndonesian subtitle of Spongebob the Movie I. Subtitle made to make the viewer understand all the stories in a movie. Other experts propose subtitling as "the process of providing synchronized captions for film and television dialogue (and more recently for live opera)" (Suttleworth and Cowie, 1997, as cited in Setiawan, et.al 2018, p. 261). Here, translator uses equivalent to explain a language in the movie. Today, Indonesian have a great interest in watching movie. English is used as foreign language in Indonesia. That is why subtitle has important role in movie. By seeing the subtitle in a movie, the viewer will understand the content and easily to follow where the story goes. Not only in movie but also in Indonesian television program, western movies use subtitle that displayed in television screen. Subtitle used in Indonesian has different language system from other language. Sometimes, the translation has problems in translating in subtitle because there may be a certain accent or slang words which appeared in that movie. Not only that but also the quality of the subtitle itself. The sentence in subtitle may not have the same meaning in target language and it will make the readers confused in reading a subtitle. Besides, the subtitle should be clear and entertaining the audiences in the easiest way through the utterance of source language.

Maleficent is one of the famous Walt Disney production movie that have been known in many countries included Indonesia. *Maleficent* produced in 2014 and entered in Indonesia in the same year. This movie can be enjoyed by all people because the story is acceptable for children, young and adult. In this movie subtitle

is also used. In *Maleficent* movie there are some messages that cannot delivered completely by the translator. Some sentences are found strange that make the message of the movie is different from the source language.

The researchers try to get the same point about subtitle and translation in getting the opportunity to take the message intensely. Puri & Pasaribu (2019) mention that the most dominant subtitling strategy is transfering strategy the utterances in source language. Analizing the accuracy, clarity and naturalness of the subtitle aims at knowing whether the subtitle is qualified or not. It means that the translator should understand the meaning inside the source language as well as in the target language. Further, the subtitle should be clear, natural, and communicative for the audience. It does not seem like a translation. Considering the explanation above, the researchers decide to analyze the subtitle in *Maleficent* movie entitled "Translation Analysis of Subtitle from English to Indonesian in "*Maleficent*" Movie".

2   Method

This research is conducted by the researchers using qualitative approach because the researchers analyse data in the form of description such as words and sentences. This is a kind of content or document research that analyses the script of *Maleficent* movie. The researchers use qualitative descriptive as research design.

The researchers use the video from minutes 25.00 until 45.00, the script of *Maleficent* movie, the result of viewer and experts' evaluation as the source of data. The researchers use some techniques such as documentation, sample and purposive sampling in collecting data of this research. The researchers use component in analyzing data from Miles and Hubermen and it consists of three activities, they are data reduction, data display and drawing a conclusion or verification. In this research, the researchers decide to use investigator triangulation to check the validity of data. The researchers ask some experts who have capability in translation scope to identify and analyse the data finding so the research can be trusted. The experts analyze the script of the movie to check the clarity, accuracy and naturalness. Parameter of clarity, accuracy and naturalness used is taken from Nababan (in Silalahi 2009: 99-100).

3   Result and Findings

3.1   The Clarity of Subtitle from English into Indonesian in *Maleficent* Movie

In this subtitle, the translator uses some sentences that categorized in clear, less clear and unclear. The high presentation of this subtitle occurs in clear category. The percentage of clear is 77%, less clear 19.8% and unclear 3.2%.

Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 99) states that the clarity of translation result can be divided into three levels. They are clear, less clear and unclear. Clear happens when the translation result can be fully understood by the audience. Less clear means that the audience can catch what is being talked in the text but sometimes they should reread the text to understand the translation. Meanwhile, unclear happens in the translation caused the reader can not understand the translation result because the meaning is not clearly explained. The presentation of clear subtitle is 77%, it means that the translator transfers the source language clearly. The reader can understand well the translation result in the subtitle. The message of the original language can also be delivered as same as possible in translation result. It can be seen from the subtitle, there are 101 sentences which are categorized into clear sentence in 131 sentences used in this research. Here is the analysis of the sentence number 10:

> SL: They say it's to be a grand celebration.
> TL: *Mereka bilang akan ada perayaan mewah.*

This sentence is clear because it can be clearly understood only by reading it at once. The message and the meaning has been delivered as well as source language in target language. Larson (1998: 531) says that a translation can be called as clear translation if the reader can understand well because the language in translation result is clear. That is why the reader gives mark in the column of clear. Another example is the sentence number 38 that categorized into clear sentence. Here is the result of the translation:

> SL: Even the rabble.
> TL: *Bahkan ada rakyat jelata*

The sentence above also is clear translation because the translator uses the words that represent the meaning from the source language in target language so it can be clearly understood by the reader. The words *Bahkan ada rakyat jelata* is a simple sentence and the reader can read the word easily to get the meaning. As stated by Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 99) a translation is clear if the translation result can be fully understood by the audience. It can be seen from the result of reader evaluation that the reader gives mark in clear column.

The third example is less clear that occurs in the sentence number 36 decribed as follows:

SL: What a glittering assemblage, King Stefan

TL: *Suatu kumpulan nan memukau, Raja Stefan*

As pointed above, the sentence in target language is less clear because the reader cannot catch the meaning and understand the sentence by only reading it in first time. The translator uses inappropriate words in the target language. The words *nan memukau* will be better if they are replaced with the words *yang menakjubkan* to make the reader understands to what the author means in this sentence. It is related to the parameter of less clear translation by Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 99), *tingkat keterbacaan sedang jika pada umumnya terjemahan dapat dipahami oleh pembaca; namun ada bagian tertentu yang harus dibaca lebih dari satu kali untuk memahami terjemahan.* It means that a translation result still can be read and understood by the reader but some parts in the translation result that needs to give more attention to know the real meaning inside the text. It can be caused by the use of words that are not appropriate in target language. It is the same result from Fitria (2015). The study reports that the most dominant type of translation technique is Established Equivalence and translation quality assessment, in translation accuracy, the higher percentage is accurate.The appropriate words that suggested is *Suatu kumpulan yang menakjubkan, Raja Stefan*.

The sample of unclear is explained below. The translator translates the sentence without keeping the real meaning of the source language. It can be seen in the following sentence:

SL: But we in the middle of nowhere

TL: *Tapi kita di tempat antah berantah*

The translation result does not transfer the meaning correctly. The translation result will be more appropriate if it is replaced with *Tapi kita tidak tau dimana kita berada* to make it clear and understood easily by the reader. As stated by Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 99) unclear translation result happens in the translation because the reader cannot understand the translation result since the meaning is not clearly explained.

3.2 The Accuracy of Subtitle from English into Indonesian in *Maleficent* Movie

The subtitle in *Maleficent* movie is accurate with a great percentage even there are some sentences categorized into less accurate and inaccurate gathered from two experts evaluation. The presentation of accuracy from the first expert is 82.5% where there are 108 sentences included in this category. Meanwhile the presentation required from the second expert is 83.9% with 131 accurate sentences. The different of both presentations of accuracy are almost the same. Less accurate sentences also found in those two experts with percentage 14.5% and 16.1%. Inaccurate sentences only found in the result of the first expert with presentation 3.0% where there are 4 sentences included in this category. Based on Burliani & Winiharti (2016) state that n producing an accurate translation, a translator has to consider the context in which the original utterances occur.

In this subtitle, the researchers analyse the sentence using the theory from Larson and Nababan (in Silalahi). There are some sentences used in dialogues that categorized into accurate, less accurate and inaccurate. Accurate is the highest percentage in this subtitle from both two experts which is 82.5% and 83.9%. The presentation of less accurate of both two experts are small number that are 14.5% and 16.1%. The result of inaccurate sentence only found in the first expert evaluation where there are only 4 sentences from the rest 131 sentences. The example of the sentences can be explained below.

First, the researchers analyse the sentence number 8 that included in accurate category. The number is given point 3 by two experts. The sentence presented as follows:

SL: King Stefan and the Queen have had a child.

TL: *Raja Stefan dan Ratunya, telah memiliki seorang anak.*

It is clear that the translation result is accurate with the source language. The translation uses the words in target language that have the same meanings with the words in target language so it can keep the meaning of the source language in target language. In that sentence, there is no missing meaning in target language and the translation is completely accurate. This is supported by Larson (1998: 530) that accurate sentence is when the reader read the translation text as in this subtitle, the reader can understand the meaning that is being shown from the source language.

The second example is the sentence number 61 that categorized into accurate translation by the experts evaluation. The sentence is shown as follows:

SL: This curse will last until the end of time.

TL: *Kutukan ini akan bertahan sampai dunia berakhir.*

The translation above is the accurate translation because the idea and the meaning from the source language is delivered completely. The reader can easily get the information from the source language only by reading it once. It is relevant with the explanation of Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 99) that accurate translation is when the translator uses the word that has the same meaning in source and target languages.

The example of less accurate translation is the sentence number 31 that can be described as follows:

SL: Only happy, all the days of your life.

TL: *Hanya ada kebahagiaan disepanjang hidupmu.*

In this translation the translator uses the word that is not really appropriate in target language. The meaning is still delivered but some words are translated less accurately. The more appropriate sentence suggested is *Hanya kebahagian disetiap hari-hari dalam hidupmu.* The translator does not translate the word *days* in target language. This sentence included in less accurate category. This is related to the statement of Larson (1998: 526) that sometimes the translator omitted, added or deleted some words in the translation result and it will make the translation is not communicative to the reader.

The fourth sentence as the example of less accuracy category is the sentence number 48 that explained as follows:

SL: The princess shall indeed grow in grace and beauty

TL: *Sang puteri memang akan tumbuh besar penuh kebahagiaan.*

The sentence above categorized into less accurate translation because the translator does not translate the word *beauty* of the source language. The meaning is still delivered but the information cannot be delivered completely. The more appropriate result suggested is *Sang puteri memang akan tumbuh dalam kebahagian dan cantik.* It will make the translation result is accurate.

As a sample of inaccurate translation is the sentence number 70 that can be explained as follows:

SL: Oh, no! What is it?

TL: *Oh tidak! Apa ini tempatnya*?

The sentence above is inaccurate because the translator uses inappropriate words in target language so that the meaning of translation result will be different. The word *tempatnya* creates new meaning within this sentence. It will change the information from source language. It can be accurate if the translator replaces the words *tempatnya*. The closer meaning to source language of the sentence *What is it*? is *apa ini?*. So the translation result suggested below:

TL: *Oh tidak! Apa ini?*

3.3 Naturalness of Subtitle from English into Indonesian in *Maleficent* Movie

The highest presentation of naturalness in *Maleficent* movie that evaluated by two different experts is in category natural. The results of both two experts are quite similar with the presentation of first expert is 79.3% and the second expert is 77.1%. It can be concluded that the translation result or subtitle in *Maleficent* movie is natural, however the translator uses some sentences that categorized in less natural and unnatural translation. Based on Sura (2019) the subtitling strategy produced the most natural subtitles is decimation, followed by paraphrase, deletion, transfer, condensation, imitation, expansion, resignation and finally transcription.

In this subtitle, the researchers analyse the quality of the translation in natural category from the result of evaluation by two different experts. The first expert evaluates that in this subtitle there are 104 sentences included in natural category, 24 less natural sentences and 3 sentences unnatural category. Meanwhile, the second expert has evaluated the subtitle of *Maleficent* movie and the result of the evaluation there are 101 natural sentences, 28 less natural sentences, and 2 unnatural sentences. From the evaluations above, it can be concluded that the translation result or subtitle in *Maleficent* movie is natural.

The following sentences are the examples of natural, less natural and unnatural sentences. First, the researchers take number 23 that categorized into natural translation. The sentence has been given point 3 by two experts. The sentence presented below:

SL: They bring gifts for our daughter

TL: *Mereka membawa hadiah untuk puteri kita*

It is clear that the translation result is natural. The researchers use the words that represent the meaning of the source language naturally. The reader can easily read the translation and understand the translation result because the translation result sound familiar and not strange. It is relevant with the explanation of Larson (1998: 531) that translation result should be as natural as possible and does not sound strange for the reader.

The second example is the sentence number 39 that included in natural translation as follows:

SL: I must say I really felt quite distressed of not receiving an invitation.

TL: *Harus kuakui aku merasa sangat sedih karena tak menerima undanganmu.*

The sentence above can be said as natural translation because the translator uses the words that familiar with the reader in target language. The reader can easily catch the meaning of the translation result. The structure of the target language also appropriate with the target language that is Indonesian. The sentence above can be called as the natural translation, it is also supported by Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 100) that natural translation means that the translation result uses the word that familiar with the audience and the structures is appropriate with the structure in target language.

The sentence number 5 is the example of less natural translation that described below:

SL: Well, well, I saw nothing.
TL: *Bagaimana, aku tak melihat apapun.*

The sentence above called less natural because the translator uses less appropriate word in translation result. The meaning may still delivered but there are some problems in grammatical order. The word *bagaimana* is a question word in target language so it needs question mark, but in the translation result there is no question mark. This can make the reader confused in accepting the meaning. So it can be more natural if the translation result replaced with *Bagaimana, aku tak melihat apapun***?** It can be easily understood by the reader. It is relevant with Nababan (in Silalahi 2009: 100) that less natural translation happens when the words in translation result are commonly used by the reader but still has some terms that grammatically errors.

The next number is the sentence number 74 below:

SL: Or a bigger body
TL: *Atau tubuh yang lebih besar.*

The sentence above is categorized into less natural translation however the meaning still can be accepted by the reader. The translator uses the word that is not really appropriate with target language so it sounds little bit strange. It can be more natural if the translation result changed become *atau ukuran tubuh yang lebih besar.* This is supported with the explanation of Nababan (in Silalahi, 2009: 100) that if the translation result can be understood by the reader but there are still grammatically some errors.

The example of unnatural translation in this subtitle can be found in the sentence number 53 that can be described as follows:

SL: A sleep from which she will never awaken.
TL: *Tertidur dimana dia tak akan pernah terbangun lagi*

The sentence above can be called as unnatural translation because the translator makes the wrong word order so the translation results sounds strange and the reader can see that it seems like translation. It can be natural if the translator changes the translation result become *Dia akan tertidur dan tidak akan pernah bangun lagi.* It can be accepted by the reader easily and there is no addition or deletion in translation result of that sentence. (Nida and Taber, 1982: 173)

4. Conclusion

The clarity of subtitle in *Maleficent* movie is clear. It can be seen from the result of viewer evaluation that the highest rate is clear category. Based on the result of clarity that has been evaluated by the reader there are 101 sentences included in clear translation from the rest 131 sentences. It can be inferred that the translator translates the sentences clearly in target language. The use of words in transferring the message also appropriate in target language so the reader can understand the story completely. Furthermore, there are some problems that still occurred in this subtitle. Some sentences are translated in less clear and unclear.

The subtitle in *Maleficent* movie can be categorized into accurate translation. It can be seen from the result of evaluation from two different experts. The data shows that both experts have closed results about the accuracy of subtitle in *Maleficent* movie. The first expert evaluates that the presentation of accurate translation is 82.5% then the presentation of less accurate and inaccurate translation are 14.5% and 3%. Meanwhile, the second expert evaluates that in this subtitle there are accurate translation and less accurate translation. There is no inaccurate translation according to the second expert. The presentation of accurate and less accurate translation based on the second expert are 83.9% and 16.1%. It means that both experts have big presentation in accurate translation. So the subtitle in *Maleficent* movie can be categorized into accurate translation. However there some words that categorized into less accurate and inaccurate because there some errors in translating the subtitle.

Based on the result of experts' evaluation and explanation of the quality in translation above in can be concluded that the sentences in the subtitle of *Maleficent* movie is natural. It can be seen from the result of the expert evaluations that mostly the sentences in this subtitle is natural translation with 104 (1ˢᵗ expert) and 101 (2ⁿᵈ expert) included in natural category from the rest sentence is 131 sentences. There are still some sentences that translated less naturally.

References

Burliani, D., Winiharti, M. (2016). Innacuracy in Indonesian Subtitiles of The King's Speech Movie (2010). *Lingua Cultura*, 10(1). 57-62. http://dx.doi.org/10.21512/lc.v10i1.923

Chang, Yan. 2012. A Tentative Analysis of English Film Translation Characteristics and Principles. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 2 (1): 71 – 76.

Larson, Mildred L. 1998. *Meaning-Based Translation*. New York: University Press of America.

Nida, E.A. & Taber C.R. 1982. *The Theory and Practice of Translation*. Netherland: United Bible Societies.

Puri, D.A.L. & Pasaribu, T.A. 2019. Pubg Fansubtitle: Strategies and Translation Acceptability. *Journal of Language and Literature*, 19(2).

Sarasmara, A.S. & Yuliasr, I. 2018. Translation Techniques in Indonesian Subtitle of "Spongebob The Movie I", *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research (ASSEHR)*, vol.188, in UNNES International Conference on English Language Teaching, Literature, and Translation (ELTLT).

Setiawan, K., Ambhita D, & Hanifa, P. 2018. *Strategi Penerjemahan dan Kesepadanan Makna pada Terjemahan Subtitle Film "Turah", Mengangkat Bahasa Jawa Ngapak ke Kancah Internasional. Prosiding Seminar Nasional dan Call for Papers "Pengembangan Sumber Daya Perdesaan dan Kearifan Lokal Berkelanjutan VIII"*. Purwokerto, pp. 259-272.
accesed at http://jurnal.lppm.unsoed.ac.id/ojs/index.php/Prosiding/article/viewFile/647/585.

Silalahi, Roswita. 2009. *Dampak Teknik, Metode, dan Ideologi Penerjemahan Teks Medical-Surgical Nursing dalam Bahasa Indonesia*. Sumatera Utara: Sekolah Pascasarjana Universitas Sumatera Utara;.

Suherman, K.W & Gumawan, W. 2018. Translation Shifts in The Indonesian Subtitle of The Revenant Film: A Systemic Functional Linguistics Approach, *Passage,* 6(1), 76-91.

Sura, S.L. 2019. *Analysis of Subtitling Strategies and Naturalness of Indonesian Fansub on Pewdiepie's Youtube Videos.* Unpublish Thesis. Universitas Negeri Semarang.

Fitria, T.N. 2015. *Translation Technique of English to Indonesian Subtitle in Doraemon "Stand by Me" Movie.* Unpublish Thesis. Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta.